

HIGH SCHOOL CURRICULUM



TABLE OF CONTENTS

HIGH SCHOOL EDUCATOR GUIDE FOR THE REPORT

USING *The report* in your classroom

High School Content Mapping and Standards

A Note on Euphemisms

MODULE I

The Report: A Critical Media Analysis Unit

LESSON ONE: Reading Film as Text **LESSON TWO:** Watch *The Report* **LESSON THREE:** Behind the Scenes

MODULE II

Teaching The Report: A Case Study on Oversight and Accountability

LESSON ONE: The Report in Context— September 11, 2001 in the United States LESSON TWO: Watching The Report LESSON THREE: Understanding the CIA's Detention and Interrogation Program LESSON FOUR: Truth Matters—Oversight

of the Intelligence Community **LESSON FIVE:** A Closer Look at the

Conclusions of The Report

LESSON SIX: Eliminating Torture Altogether

ASSESSMENT





USING THE REPORT IN YOUR HIGH SCHOOL CURRICULUM

"It is my sincere and deep hope that through the release of these Findings and Conclusions and Executive Summary that U.S. policy will never again allow for secret indefinite detention and the use of coercive interrogations... This and future Administrations should use this Study to guide future programs, correct past mistakes, increase oversight of CIA representations to policymakers, and ensure coercive interrogation practices are not used by our government again." ¹

- Senator Dianne Feinstein

1 Senate Select Committee on Intelligence, *The Senate Intelligence Committee Report on Torture*, Executive Summary of the Committee Student of the Central Intelligence Agency's Detention and Interrogation Program, 113th Cong., 2 dess, 2014, Committee Print 113-288, Academic edition, p. xix, xiv. See online https://www.intelligence.senate.gov/sites/default/files/publications/CRPT-113srpt288.pdf, p. 3, p.6.

Today's students, all born after the September 11, 2001 terrorist attacks in the United States, have grown up in a country perpetually fighting a so-called war on terror and live in and with the shadow of its legacy. For them the 9/11 attacks and the CIA's post - 9/11 Detention and Interrogation program are increasingly a fading memory, lacking historical context and perspective.

To address this need, *The Report* and high school curriculum offers an unparalleled opportunity for students' to learn through the power of film, primary sources, multimedia assets, and educational curriculum.

Essential Questions

Given the complexity of the topic, the curriculum is organized into two discipline specific modules guiding students to explore these essential questions:

- How did the United States government respond in the aftermath of 9/11?
- How does our U.S. system of checks and balances, originally put in place by the framers of our Constitution, maintain an effective separation of powers?
- How does Congressional oversight ensure that leaders and intelligence agencies are held accountable and do not abuse their power?
- Why is this story relevant today?

Module I – *The Report:* A Critical Media Analysis Unit

This module is designed for high school units focusing on rhetoric, critical media literacy, film studies, and/or contemporary History/Politics that includes an examination of the construction of a post-9/11 American narrative. Given the wealth of rhetorical devices actually used (i.e.-euphemisms) to examine the power of a narrative to dehumanize an entire group of people, *The Report* curriculum is a treasure trove for educators seeking new and compelling content to reinforce established units.

Module II – A Case Study on U.S. Intelligence, Oversight, and Accountability

This module is designed for an upper level History or Government class with units examining post-9/11 U.S. Intelligence, congressional oversight and accountability, the Senate Intelligence Committee Report on Torture, and the legacy of the CIA's Detention and Interrogation Program today. The module can also lay the foundation for learning about the 9/11 Guantánamo trials set for 2021 and the inability of the U.S. government to bring 9/11 planners to justice because of the CIA's actions.²

** Note: The lessons refer to the full film of *The Report* available on Amazon Prime, and to film clips and bonus content available by accessing the links and through Amazon's X-Ray feature. Amazon Prime members can access the X-Ray feature in the upper left corner of the streaming window.

² See "The Trial: Inside Guantánamo With 9/11 Suspect Ammar al-Baluchi," to understand the complexity of the upcoming 9/11 trials. https://www.theguardian.com/us-news/ng-interactive/2019/feb/22/the-trial-inside-the-ammar-al-baluchi-guantanamo-trial-video



Learning Goals

Depending upon the discipline, students will:

- · Strengthen their critical media literacy analysis skills
- Study a period of recent U.S. history highly relevant to students' lives today
- Examine the CIA's Detention and Interrogation Program after the 9/11 attacks
- Understand congressional oversight, especially over the secret agencies of the intelligence community
- Understand the ineffectiveness of torture as a method for gaining reliable intelligence
- Explore the legacy of the Senate Select Committee on Intelligence Report on Torture within America and abroad

High School Content Mapping and Standards

Given the content of *The Report*, and the R rating of the film, it is important to secure parental permission for students under 17, and approval from your administration to view the entire film in class.

<u>Common Core Alignment</u> English/Language Arts and History/Social Studies

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.11-12.1 CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.11-12.2 CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.11-12.3 CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.11-12.5 CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RI.11-12.6 CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RH.11-12.7 CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RH.11-12.9 CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RH.11-12.10

Advanced Placement Units

AP United States Government

- Unit 1: Foundations of American Democracy
- Unit 2: Interactions Among Branches of Government
- Unit 3: Civil Liberties and Civil Rights
- Unit 4: American Political Ideologies and Beliefs
- Unit 5: Political Participation

AP United States History

Unit 9: Period 9: 1980-Present

AP World History: Modern

Unit 9: Globalization

A Note on Euphemisms

"I really was upset about the appropriation of euphemistic language to conceal things that are torture. It is stunning to me that in the initial CIA communiques after 9/11, they called it torture, and then someone must've said, 'That's against the law. We need to come up with a new name for it.' That is very upsetting to me. It should be upsetting to everybody."

 Writer, Director, and Producer of The Report, Scott Z. Burns

A euphemism is defined as "the substitution of an agreeable or inoffensive expression for one that may offend or suggest something unpleasant." Language holds power. The CIA's use of the term "enhanced interrogation techniques," obscured through the acronym "EITs" in place of the word "torture," is worth expanding upon before beginning any lesson in this curriculum

The term "EITs" was used by the CIA to hide their use of torture on at least 39 of the known 119 detainees held in numerous secret detention sites around the world. The Department of Justice (DOJ) and the White House approved the CIA's use "enhanced interrogation techniques" under the so-called Torture Memo drafted by John Yoo, Deputy Assistant Attorney General of the United States. The memo, signed in August 2002, adopted a very close interpretation of what constitutes "unique information" based on the necessity defense, and claimed that only by waterboarding, (or using other torture methods) could the CIA obtain specific intelligence needed to thwart terrorist attacks and save American lives.

³ https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/euphemism, accessed November 15, 2019.



A larger discussion on the use of euphemisms as a tool of propaganda may get sparked by introducing the context of "EITs." Students do not need to look too far to see examples in history - Argentina and "the Dirty Wars" (1976-1983), the Nazi Period (1933-1945) and "The Final Solution" are examples of euphemisms used to hide repressive policies and violence. Thus, in The Report curriculum when the acronym of "EITs" is used, it will consistently be in quotes to demarcate it as a euphemism and used only when directly referencing the CIA's program.⁴ Otherwise coercive interrogation techniques, or torture, will be used depending upon the context.

Module I The Report: A Critical Media Analysis Unit

Introduction

Film is no longer an ancillary text. It is text, and more than ever students need to have the critical media literacy skills to be active, engaged, and critical consumers of all forms of media.

The Report, based on the actual Senate Intelligence Committee Report on Torture, offers a unique opportunity for students to examine rhetorical devices used in film as an exercise in critical media literacy. While not a documentary, The Report is a docu-drama and puts forth an argument like a compelling documentary film, or well written essay. Like an author, writer, director and producer Scott Z. Burns has made a film with authorial intent, crafting and editing scenes with a point of view and with

aesthetic choices in mind.

Students will analyze his point of view and his choices of rhetorical devices used in the making of the film—logos, pathos, ethos, and kairos. Students will actively watch the full film and explore the short "Behind the Scenes" commentary and interviews Scott Z. Burns and Daniel J. Jones created for *The Report* Movie Deep Dive Website. Active film watching requires students to take notes with the expectation that when the film is over, these observations will be shared and contribute to their peers' learning.

Note to Educator: The film is rated R and contains graphic recreations of interrogations and torture that are disturbing. With this in mind, educators should screen the film first and provide due warnings to students and departmental supervisors if needed. If students are under 17 parental permission is necessary.

Essential Questions

- How can film be an effective tool to teaching rhetoric?
- How can students recognize the differences between fact and opinion in the media and understand that all media has a point of view?

Length and Recommended Unit Pacing

- Introduction to Reading Film as Text: 1 day
- Watching The Report (2-3 days)
- Analyzing Select Scenes and Techniques of Filmmaking (2-4 days)

⁴ See the Senate Report: "On September 17, 2001, the President signed a covert action Memorandum of Notification (MON) granting the CIA unprecedented counterterrorism authorities, including the authority to covertly capture and detain individuals 'posing a continuing, serious threat of violence or death to U.S. persons and interests or planning terrorist activities.' The MON made no reference to interrogations or coercive interrogation techniques." Senate Select Committee on Intelligence's "Committee Study of the CIA'; Detention and Interrogation Program" released December 9, 2014, located at Findings and Conclusions page 9 of 19. Audio Book link to "Findings and Conclusions" Chapter.



LESSON ONE

Reading Film as Text

Lesson Goals

Students will:

- Review the history of the terrorist attacks that occurred on September 11, 2001
- Reflect on how and where we learn about historical events and access their credibility
- Review rhetorical devices and reflect on how they apply to The Report

Materials

- Computers and access to the internet
- Projection equipment to screen a short film from the
 9/11 Memorial and Museum Website

Length

One 55-minute class period

Activity

- Have students create a T-Chart table listing one prompt on the top of each column. Students will pair up, interview one another using these questions, record responses on the chart, and be able to share out approximately one minute per question.
 - What do you know about the September 11, 2001 terrorist attacks?
 - What do you know about how the United States government responded in the aftermath of the attacks?
- 2. Debrief Interview
 - Go around the room and have volunteers share details from their interviews.
- 3. Next write on the board these questions and discuss as a class?
 - How do you assess the accuracy of information about September 11, 2001?
 - What sources do you rely on to gain accurate information?
 - What criteria and skills of analysis are necessary to determine if this information is correct?
- 4. To ensure that all students have a shared historical

- understanding of the events, show this short clip from the 9/11 National Memorial and Museum. The clip is embedded on the lesson "What happened on 9/11, Part I" and listed under Step 4.
- 5. Debrief the clip as a class, asking students to share (1) their initial reactions, (2) any new information they learned, (3) any questions that remain, (4) and how they know this short film is accurate (enforcing the role of sourcing).
- 6. Introduce, or revisit, rhetorical devices and discuss with students what rhetorical devices were used in the short clip.

A rhetorical device is a linguistic tool that employs a particular type of sentence structure, sound, or pattern of meaning in order to evoke a particular reaction from an audience. Each rhetorical device is a distinct tool that can be used to construct an argument or make an existing argument more compelling.

Any time you try to inform, persuade, or argue with someone, you're engaging in rhetoric. If you've ever had an emotional reaction to a speech or changed your mind about an issue after hearing a skilled debater's rebuttal, you've experienced the power of rhetoric. By developing a basic knowledge of rhetorical devices, you can improve your ability to process and convey information while also strengthening your persuasive skills.

Review the four rhetorical devices.

- Logos seeks to convince and persuade via logic and reason. This usually means making use of statistics, cited facts, and statements by authorities to persuade the listener.
- 2) Pathos appeals in emotion. This could mean invoking sympathy or pity in the listener, or making the audience angry in the service of inspiring action or changing their mind about something.



- 3) Ethos refers to the ethical appeal, and is based on the character, credibility, or reliability of the writer or speaker whose words have weight and must be taken seriously because they have the experience and judgment necessary to decide what's right.
- 4) Kairos is dependent on the idea that the time has come for a particular idea or action. In other words, the timeliness of the idea is part of the argument.
- 7. Explain to students that over the next few days they will be actively watching and analyzing a Hollywood film, *The Report*, a movie based on the post 9/11 activities of the CIA, the Department of Justice, the White House, and the U.S. Senate Select Committee on Intelligence.
- 8. Discuss with students the following questions:
 - Can a Hollywood film be a reliable source of information to learn about 9/11 and post-9/11 America? Why or why not?
 - What tools of media analysis can they employ to discern if The Report tells an accurate story?
 - How does the passage of time impact the ability to acquire accurate and truthful information on an event? Why might the initial version of history be flawed?

9. End class by telling students that in order to finish the film in two class periods, they will need every minute of class. (If a 90 min block period, adjust accordingly) Beginning tomorrow, they will be assigned one of three tracks to focus upon when viewing the film. Their responsibility is the "read" the film with this lens in mind.

Review the three tracks:

Visual Track

These are the images that are seen onscreen. They could be primary footage shot by the filmmaker (A roll), cutaways that support or counter other visuals perhaps shot by the filmmaker (B roll), or they could be found (archival) footage from some other source used to meet the new film's purposes.

Audio Track

This is the sound heard in the film. It could include the voices and dialogue of people in the Film, narration, music, and sound effects.

Text Track (or Graphic Track):

This is the written information that appears on screen added by the filmmaker in post production. Examples are subtitles, identifications, charts, and graphs.

Note: An Annotated Script, which can be found on Genius and under Tab IV of *The Report* Movie Deep Dive Website, details the sources used for every scene in the movie.



LESSON TWO

Watching The Report

Lesson Goals

Students will:

- Actively watch The Report
- Take notes on Note Catcher focusing on one of the three rhetorical devices assigned
- Summarize their observations and be prepared to share with the class

Materials

- Copies of Note Catcher Handout
- Equipment to screen The Report
- Access to Amazon Prime

Length

At least two 55-minute class periods

Activity

DAY ONE

- Distribute The Report Note Catcher. Assign students to focus on one of three tracks—the Visual, Audio, or Text Track.
- 2. Collect Note Catchers at the end of Day One for a quick review of student work.

DAY TWO

- 1. Pass out Note Catchers and resume the film and active watching.
- 2. Complete Note Catcher and film screening
- 3. Assign these questions for students to prepare to discuss the next day at the opening of class. It may also be helpful to have students write short answers to each question in preparation for the class discussion.
 - What personal reactions do you have to The Report?
 - What questions came up in the course of watching the film?
 - What do they think the director wanted the audience to see and experience?
 - What filmmaking conventions did the director rely on to achieve these goals?
 - What is/are the argument(s) being made in The Report?



Vocabulary of Film Shots and Technique, and Note Catcher

Visual Track

These are the images that are seen onscreen. They could be primary footage shot by the filmmaker (A roll), cutaways that support or counter other visuals perhaps shot by the filmmaker (B roll), or they could be found (archival) footage from some other source used to meet the new film's purposes.

Audio Track

This is the sound heard in the film. It could include the voices and dialogue of people in the film, narration, music, and sound effects.

Text Track (or Graphic Track):

This is the written information that appears on screen added by the filmmaker in post-production. Examples are subtitles, identifications, charts, and graphs.

Keep in mind these questions as you take notes:

Editing: How the visual, audio, and text tracks are assembled. Consider, for example, how the music or images work to support or juxtapose each other.

Framing/Shots: Are we seeing the image in a close-up, medium shot, or long shot? Why? How does this change the logos, pathos, or ethos?

Camera Angles: Is the camera filming the image from above (high angle), below (low angle) or eye-level? Why? How does this change the logos, pathos, or ethos?

Lighting: Is the scene filled primarily with lots of light or with darkness and shadows? Why?



Vocabulary of Film Shots and Technique, and Note Catcher

Primary / archival footage, still pictures, etc.
Identifications, subtitles, information, etc.
Voices, music, sound effects, etc.



LESSON THREE

"Behind the Scenes" of The Report

Lesson Goals:

Students will:

- Reflect and share their critical analysis of The Report
- Watch a series of short video pieces with commentary from writer, director, and producer Scott Z.
 Burns and protagonist, Daniel Jones that offer keen insights on the making of *The Report*
- Synthesize prior background knowledge with new information about filmmaking techniques and decisions made to create the emotional arch desired

Materials

- Copies of Handout Behind the Scenes Note Catcher
- The Report Podcast, Ep 5, "The Panetta Review and Other CIA Mistakes"
- Access to <u>The Report Movie Deep Dive Website</u> (Amazon Prime membership required)
- <u>Tab II Timeline "The Events that Inspired The Report"</u>
- Equipment to project the six Film Scene Commentaries.
- * To access, Amazon Prime members click "View All" next to X-Ray in the upper left hand corner of your screen and choose "Bonus Content."

Length

One or two 55-minute class periods

Activity

- 1. Opening: Take a moment to debrief *The Report*:
 - What personal reactions do you have to The Report?
 - What questions came up in the course of watching the film?
 - What do you think the director wanted the audience to see and experience?
 - What filmmaking conventions did the director rely on to achieve these goals?
 - What is/are the argument(s) being made in The Report?

- Explain to students that they will now listen to unique video commentary pieces from writer, director, and producer Scott Z. Burns on his filmmaking decisions for *The Report*, and from Daniel Jones who reflects on specific scenes in the film.
- 3. Distribute the "Film Scene Commentaries" Note Catcher and organize students in pairs or small groups of no more than four. Explain that rather than focus on one track only as they did when watching The Report, students will now have the opportunity to explore and apply all their understanding of media analysis to these six short pieces.

Leave at least five minutes in between segments for small groups/pairs to discuss and identify the clips' placement among the rhetorical devices. Before moving on to the next commentary, it may be interesting to have groups share their rationale and choice of track.

Note: If you are an Amazon Prime member you can access these X-ray features once you login to your Prime Account. For non-members, the links will take you directly to the film commentary.

- "Daniel J. Jones's Assignment" (runtime, 2:43 minutes)
- <u>"It's Only Legal if it Works"</u> (runtime, 2:20 minutes)
- <u>"Summer of Hell"</u> (runtime, 3:12 minutes)
- "Confirmation Hearing" (runtime, 3:00 minutes)
- <u>"A Sunlight Problem"</u>
 (runtime, 3:02 minutes)
- <u>"Crossing a Line"</u> (runtime, 3:41 minutes)
- 4. Closing Assignment

To demonstrate their understanding of this unit, students will have a choice of assessment assignments.

1) Write a film review of *The Report* that uses the four rhetorical devices as the basis of the review.

OR

 Create a short film that communicates the four rhetorical devices and how they were used in the making of *The Report*.



Behind the Scenes Note Catcher

Visual Track	Primary / archival footage, still pictures, etc.
Text Track	Identifications subtitles information at
TEXT HACK	Identifications, subtitles, information, etc.
Sound Track	Voices, music, sound effects, etc.
Other Observations	



MODULE II

Teaching The Report: A Case Study on Oversight and Accountability

Introduction

The 6,700- page classified Senate Intelligence Committee Report on Torture may remain out of students' hands for some time. However there is a great deal to learn from the published, albeit redacted, Executive Summary, the film *The Report* Movie Deep Dive Website with its wealth of curated documents and unique Podcast, Audio Book, and curriculum for students of American History, Government, and World History. *The Report* Movie Deep Dive Website gives students the chance to investigate how the United States of America got in the "business" of torture after 9/11, the role of Congressional oversight and accountability, and what is the legacy of the CIA's Detention and Interrogation Program post-9/11.

Note to Educator: The film is rated R and contains graphic recreations of interrogations and torture that are disturbing. With this in mind, educators should screen the film first and provide due warnings to students and departmental supervisors if needed. If students are under 17 parental permission is necessary.

Essential Questions

- What happened on September 11, 2001 in the United States?
- How did the United States government and intelligence community respond to the events of 9/11?
- What critical role did Congressional oversight and accountability play in post-9/11 America?
- What can we learn from the Senate's "Torture Report" about the health and survival of our U.S. democracy?
- What is the legacy of the CIA's Detention and Interrogation Program today?

Length and Recommended Unit Pacing

- The Report in Context—September 11, 2001 in the United States (1 day)
- Watching The Report (2 days)
- Understanding the CIA Detention and Interrogation Program (3 days)
- Truth Matters—Oversight of the Intelligence Community (2 days)
- A Closer Look at the Conclusions of The Report (1 day)
- Legacy (1 day)
- Assessment



LESSON ONE

The Report in Context—September 11, 2001 in the United States

Introduction

In order to have the necessary context to examine and learn from *The Report*, Lesson One focuses solely on deepening students background knowledge on 9/11 prior to watching *The Report* in class.

Lesson Goals

Students will:

- Assess prior knowledge of the events of 9/11 in the United States
- Understand the timeline of events that occurred on 9/11 in the United States
- Analyze the importance of investigative journalism for government accountability

Materials:

- Computers and access to the internet
- Projection equipment to screen a short film from the
 9/11 Memorial and Museum Website.

Length

One 55-minute lesson

Activity

 Have students write down these three questions and answer what they can by accessing only their prior background knowledge.

- What happened on September 11, 2001 in the United States?
- Who was responsible for the attacks?
- Why did the attacks occur?

If they do not know the answers, reassure students that they will be able to begin answering the question over the course of the lesson.

- Show this short video included in a lesson from the 9/11 Memorial and Museum Website that explains the events of that day. After viewing the video take a moment to allow students to process what they saw, sharing any thoughts, feelings, or questions. Students may also add to the answers if there was new information learned from the video.
- 3. Transition from the large group; to students exploring the <u>September 11 Attack Timeline</u> either on their own, or in small groups. The focus of their exploration should be to complete the answers to the three questions asked, but students are invited to explore and listen to the timeline to learn as much as they can about the events of the day.
- Closing: Ask students to share documents, recordings, photographs, or other source material they
 explored on the 9/11 Attack Timeline as a way of
 sharing and as a way to remember all that was lost.



LESSON TWO

Watching The Report

Lesson Goals

Students will:

- Actively watch The Report and take notes using the Note Catcher Handout
- Strengthen their critical media literacy skills
- Reflect on the scope of content learned through the use of film

Materials

- Copies of Note Catcher Handout
- Equipment to screen The Report (available to Amazon Prime members)

Length

At least two, 55-minute class periods

Activity

DAY ONE

- Explain to students that over the next two days they will be watching *The Report*, a film that tells one story of how the U.S. Government responded to the attacks of September 11th.
- Distribute The Report Note Catcher. Review with students the parameters and expectations for taking notes on The Report explained in the Directions on the Handout.

3. Collect Note Catchers at the end of Day One for a quick review of student work.

DAY TWO

- Pass out Note Catchers and resume the film and active watching.
- 2. Complete Note Catcher and film screening

POST-VIEWING

- Assign these questions for students to prepare to discuss the next day at the opening of class. It may also be helpful to have students write short answers to each of the questions in preparation for the class discussion.
 - What was new, surprising, and challenging to you after watching The Report?
 - Do you regard Daniel J. Jones as a heroic figure or something else?
 - What did you observe about the role and power of the Senate Select Intelligence Committee?
 - What words would you use to describe the actions of the CIA in The Report?
 - After watching The Report and learning more about the Senate's "Torture Report," did your views change about the "effectiveness" of the use of torture?



The Report Note Catcher

Directions: This Note Catcher is organized by a set of topics. It is expected that you will complete each section to the best of your ability. At the end of two days of viewing, your Note Catcher should be a document of reference for you to use throughout this unit.

If a table is not helpful and you would prefer to take notes in another way, for example, through sketchnoting or visual-note taking, as long as you understand your notes, this is fine. You will need to hand in your sketchnotes attached to this Note Catcher.

Dates Covered	
Decisions	
Historical Events	
/ Developments	
Moments of	
Tension / Conflict	



LESSON THREE

The CIA Detention and Interrogation Program

"This is not C.I.A.'s program. This is not the President's program. This is America's program."

 Michael Hayden, CIA Director, May 30, 2006—February 12, 2009

Lesson Goals

Students will:

- Understand the chronology and sequence of decisions of the CIA's Detention and Interrogation Program
- Analyze key primary source documents of the CIA Detention and Interrogation Program
- Synthesize research and complete an investigation brief

Length

Three 55-minute class periods

Materials

- Student computers and access to the internet
- The Report Movie Deep Dive Website
- Investigative Brief Handout
- Access to the text or audio book of the <u>Report of</u> the <u>Senate Select Committee on Intelligence</u>
- Equipment to screen film segment, "Rationalizing Torture." The clip is available through the link in this lesson, or for Amazon Prime members, click "View All" next to X-Ray in the upper left hand corner of your screen while the film is playing and choose "Bonus Content."

Activity

 Begin the lesson by having students share all the questions that came to mind after watching The Report.

If there are a lot of questions, great. List them on the board. (Note: in the closing exercise of this lesson you will be returning to this list of questions so be sure

- to document each class's brainstorm.) If there are not as many questions as you had hoped, it may be helpful to watch one provocative film excerpt from *The Report* and use it as a model to generate questions.
- Show the short clip, "Rationalizing Torture" Available on Amazon Prime/X-Ray function located in the upper left corner of film window. Look for the title in "The Report Curriculums."

Debrief with students:

- What did they see?
- What did they hear?
- What questions do they want to ask about the information in this clip?
- 3. Return to the board and add additional guestions.
- 4. Explain to students that over the next few days they will have the opportunity to research and investigate many of their questions related to *The Report*. It is important to remind students that while the film is based on the actual U.S. Sentate report, writer, director, and producer Scott Z. Burns compressed characters and details to tell a compelling story. Because of this, not every scene actually happened in the way that it is portrayed so try to stay away from details on a particular scene, and more focused on the larger narrative told.

Note: An Annotated Script, which can be found on Genius and under Tab IV of *The Report* Movie Deep Dive Website, details the sources used for every scene in the movie.

DAY ONE - DAY THREE

5. Distribute Handout, "The Investigative Brief." Read over the handout with students and answer any questions about the assignment. Once computers are all set to <u>The Report Movie Deep Dive Website</u>, your role for the next part of the lesson is really only to help guide students in their exploration of *The Report Movie Deep Dive Website*. It may be helpful to begin with a guided "tour" encouraging



- students to discover where the helpful research information lives (primarily on Tab III and Tab IV.)
- 6. Closing: Return to the original list of questions generated by the class after watching *The Report*.
 - What new questions can be added?
 - Did you answer any of your original?
 - What was the most compelling piece of evidence you discovered?

Finally, spend a few moments debriefing the activity with students. This is very heavy and emotionally dark content. Allow some time and create a quiet space for students to share thoughts or feelings outside of their questions, that have been weighing on their mind?

And if students are not comfortable sharing in class, invite anyone to talk one-on-one, to set up a lunch date, or send an email - any way of connecting can be very helpful.



The Investigative Brief

Now that you have seen *The Report* you understand everything that happened in response to the 9/11 attacks, right? Of course not.

Unlike Daniel J. Jones and his Senate investigation team who worked for over five years to read through 6.3 million pages of CIA materials to reach their published conclusions, you are going to have a few days to investigate your questions using the <u>The Report Movie Deep Dive Website</u> Amazon created. The questions to investigate can be your own, or you can use the Sample Question under each section to get started.

The Report Movie Deep Dive Website includes a curated collection of primary sources, and unique supplemental content such as *The Report* Podcast, to allow you to explore, question, argue, and perhaps come to an understanding of the political and moral gravity of what occurred.

Directions: Working on your own and using a preformatted Google Doc, or other shared classroom management system, you will complete The **Investigation Brief Handout** relying **solely** on the resources provided on <u>The Report Movie Deep</u> <u>Dive Website</u>, particularly Tab IV-Closer Look. Each investigation must include:

- Correct citation of the document(s) used to inform your answer
- Complete sentences with correct grammar
- At least one original question (listed as New question to ask) as a result of your research, (i.e.) something learned that sparked a new, perhaps deeper, question

Investigations

I. ORIGINS OF THE CIA DETENTION AND INTERROGATION PROGRAM

- **Sample Question:** What document was signed allowing the CIA to hold subjects in secret detention, outside of the judicial process?
- New question to ask

II. RATIONALE FOR "ENHANCED INTERROGATION TECHNIQUES"

- Sample Question: How did the CIA legally justify their use of "enhanced interrogation techniques?" (Hint: Podcast 4)
- New question to ask

III. EFFECTIVE INTELLIGENCE GATHERING

- Sample Question: How did the FBI gain intelligence on suspected terrorists?
- New question to ask



IV. EXPOSURE OF THE PROGRAM

- Sample Question: Why was the death of Gul Rahman significant?
- New question to ask

V. CONTRADICTIONS

- **Sample Question:** Why did the CIA chose to transport captured suspects to third countries rather than bring them to the United States for prosecution?
- New question to ask

VI. THE SENAT[E INTELLIGENCE INVESTIGATION

- **Sample Question:** What triggered the Senate Select Committee on Intelligence to begin their investigation of the CIA program?
- New question to ask

VII. OVERSIGHT AND ACCOUNTABILITY

- Sample Question: Who has been held accountable across the government for carrying out a program of torture?
- New question to ask

VIII. "ENHANCED INTELLIGENCE TECHNIQUES" ONLY YIELDS FALSE ANSWERS AND INACCURATE INTELLIGENCE

- **Sample Question:** How did the Senate "Torture Report" prove that the CIA's claims related to the use of "EITs" as necessary to stop a future terrorist plots were wrong?
- New question to ask

IX. LEGACY TODAY

- **Sample Question:** How did the CIA's Detention and Interrogation Program influence the standing of the United States at home and abroad? (See Summary Findings)
- New question to ask

X. OTHER



LESSON FOUR

Truth Matters - Oversight and Accountability

"Congressional oversight reports begin and end with elected officials carrying out their constitutional responsibilities."

- Daniel J. Jones

Lesson Goals:

Students will:

- Understand the roles and responsibilities of Congressional oversight
- Identify the relationship of Congressional oversight and the system of checks and balances in the three branches of government
- Articulate the responsibilities of congressional investigation committees to investigate the CIA, other national security agencies, the president, and cabinet
- Analyze film segments from The Report and rank its accurate representation of oversight and accountability

Materials:

- Copies of <u>Confrontation or Collaboration? Congress</u> and the <u>Intelligence Community</u>
- Equipment to screen film clips from *The Report*.
 To access, click on links within the lesson, or for Amazon Prime members, click "View All" next to X-Ray in the upper left corner of your streaming screen, then choose "Bonus Content," and look for the heading, "The Report Curriculums"
- Access to The Report Podcast Episode 3, "The Architects of the Torture Program"

Length

Two 55-minute class periods

Activity

 Begin class by distributing copies of <u>Confrontation</u> or <u>Collaboration?</u> <u>Congress and the Intelligence</u> <u>Community</u>, a brief but thorough explanation of Congressional Oversight from the Harvard Kennedy School of Government. Have students do a close reading of this document underlining words and phrases that they see as important, circling terms that are unfamiliar, and asking questions as they complete the reading. Check for understanding by discussing why Congressional oversight is essential.

2. Transition from this overview back to *The Report* and project the following scenes specifically chosen to demonstrate oversight and accountability in action. After each clip is over, students will come to a consensus on how, why, or where oversight and accountability was being expressed in the film segment. In a round-robin format, groups will share out their viewpoints and rank the accuracy on a scale of 1 to 10 (ten being the highest/or the most accurate.)

OVERSIGHT AND ACCOUNTABILITY CLIPS FROM THE REPORT

• "Keeping Track of Laws" (runtime: 5:17 mins)

"Cover-Up" (runtime: 2:00 mins)

• "Fraught Rationalizations" (runtime: 4:30 mins)

 "Authorities and Loyalties" (runtime: 3 mins)

• "Language Negotiations" (runtime: 3 mins)

 "Intelligence Institutions & Spying" (runtime: 5 mins)

Closing Exit Ticket/Opening Entry Ticket
 At the close of <u>The Report Podcast, Episode 3</u>,
 "The Architects of the Torture Program," Daniel J.
 Jones shares the following:

"We have an accountability crisis in our country and there is no better example of this than the CIA over the past two decades. When the tapes depicting torture were destroyed, the Department of Justice opened a criminal inquiry,



and they found two individuals to be culpable for the destruction of the tapes, and they recommended to the CIA that these two individuals be disciplined. Neither were. Jose Rodriguez went on to write a book defending the use of torture and repeating the same lies about the effectiveness of the program. The other, Gina Haspel, was promoted and became CIA director in 2018."

Using this declaration as a writing prompt, "We have an accountability crisis in our country and there is no better example of this than the CIA over the past two decades," have students type a one-page op-ed column responding to Daniel J. Jones. Do they agree, or disagree, and why? If time permits, they can begin in class, otherwise students will be expected to complete their writing assignment at home and submit it at the start of class the next day.



LESSON FIVE

A Closer look at The Report

Introduction

While a large portion of the Senate's "Torture Report" remains classified, there is a great deal of information available for closer study. In this lesson students will take a closer look at the findings and conclusions of the actual Senate "Torture Report," and examine how the Senate Intelligence Committee's investigation directly addresses the most egregious claims made by the CIA on the effectiveness of their "enhanced interrogation techniques."

Lesson Goals

In this lesson students will:

- Review the sequence of events leading up to the publication of the Senate's "Torture Report"
- Discuss the summary findings from the Senate Intelligence Committee Report on Torture and strengthen consensus building skills through small group work
- Examine evidence uncovered by the Senate investigation that directly challenges the efficacy of the CIA's "enhanced interrogation techniques" and the entire Detention and Interrogation Program.

Materials

- The Report Findings and Conclusions Handout
- Student computers and access to the internet
- <u>The Report Movie Deep Dive Website</u>, especially
 Tab III: <u>Misinformation</u>, and Tab IV: <u>Closer Look</u>

Length

Two 55-minute class periods

Preparation

This two-day lesson requires a bit of preparation for it to run smoothly.

- 1. Before the lesson, have one set of the following materials for each small group of 3-4 students:
 - One envelope per group with *The Report* Findings and Conclusions Handout cut into 20 strips;

- One complete handout not cut up;
- Three pieces of paper, each listing one of the three central themes (in bold) from "The Torture Report" on the top of the page:
- The CIA's interrogation tactics were ineffective at gaining reliable intelligence and resulted in detainees providing false statements.
- II. The CIA repeatedly provided inaccurate and misleading information about the program to the White House, the Department of Justice, the Congress, and the public; including inaccurate information on the effectiveness of its "enhanced interrogation techniques," inaccurate details on the treatment of detainees and their conditions of confinement, and inaccurate information about the operation and management of the program.
- III. The CIA failed to properly manage the program—it did not implement appropriate safeguards, provide adequate oversight, or hold CIA employees accountable for wrongdoing.

Activity

- Begin by having students come into class and create a three-column KWL chart. Label the columns accordingly.
- Column One: What they know about the Senate's "Torture Report"
- Column Two: What they want to know about the Senate's "Torture Report"
- Column Three: What they learned after their investigation of the 20 Findings and Conclusions
- Transition to explaining the next phase of their investigation will focus on The Executive Summary of the Senate Torture Report and the 20 Findings and Conclusions that Daniel J. Jones and his team collated. Students will need to access to the *The Report Movie Deep Dive Website's Tab IV, Closer Look*. Specifically, the SSCI Study: Findings and Conclusions to read the commentary."



- 3. Organize the class into small groups of no more than four students. At each table students will find these materials for the next investigation:
 - One envelope per group with 20 strips of paper in it
 - One The Report Findings and Conclusion Handout
 - Three pieces of paper, each with one topic on the top of each page that are the three central themes that Daniel Jones and his team
 - Pens/pencils
- 4. Explain that as a group, they are responsible for reading through each of the 20 slips of paper, reading the commentary from the <u>The Report Movie Deep Dive Website</u> on each statement, and then, as a group, reach a consensus as to which of the central themes best reflects the summary finding. For example, here is a possible scenario that could unfold:
- #1: The CIA's use of its enhanced interrogation techniques was not an effective means of acquiring intelligence or gaining cooperation from detainees.
 Helpful questions to reach consensus:
 - Is there shared language between the central themes and the summary finding?
 - In the more in-depth commentary on The Report
 Movie Deep Dive Website, do we learn new
 information that makes a deeper connection to
 one of the central themes?
 - Can there be more than one place for this summary finding? If so, when we compare and contrast the two, does a stronger argument surface?

Note: If the group starts to get stuck, advise students to put one of the findings aside and move on to the next one and then come back to it at the end. You are also there to assist if vocabulary terms are unfamiliar

and help clarify meaning.

Many groups may easily come to the consensus that #1 Summary falls under the first central theme, "I. The CIA's interrogation tactics were ineffective at gaining reliable intelligence and resulted in detainees providing false statements."

- 5. After fielding any questions, go over a few final procedures:
 - This is not a competition. There are not necessarily "correct" or "incorrect" places for each summary finding.
 - You do not have to go in order of the Summary Findings. You can hop around as much as you like
 - Consensus means that if one person is not in agreement with the other members of the group, the group must take the time to discuss everyone's viewpoints until consensus is reached. It is not a "majority rules" game.
 - Each member of the group is responsible for their own written rationale. The group can help one another come up with a shared statement but it is recommended that after each summary is sorted, the group takes a few minutes to write a rationale statement on a shared form such as a Google doc.

Note to Educator: This exercise, if given enough time and preparation, can be a very rigorous conversation, especially if students take the time to read the summary commentary on *The Report* Movie Deep Dive Website. Encourage students to take the time to tease out what each of the 20 findings reveal about the U.S. Intelligence Community, the White House, and the process of Congressional Oversight and Accountability.



The Report Findings and Conclusions

Condensed from the SSCI Study: Findings and Conclusions link found on Tab IV, The Report Movie Deep Dive Website.

- #1: The CIA's use of its enhanced interrogation techniques was not an effective means of acquiring intelligence or gaining cooperation from detainees.
- #2: The CIA's justification for the use of its enhanced interrogation techniques rested on inaccurate claims of their effectiveness.
- #3: The interrogations of CIA detainees were brutal and far worse than the CIA represented to policy-makers and others.
- #4: The conditions of confinement for CIA detainees were harsher than the CIA had represented to policymakers and others.
- #5: The CIA repeatedly provided inaccurate information to the Department of Justice, impeding a proper legal analysis of the CIA's Detention and Interrogation Program.
- #6: The CIA has actively avoided or impeded congressional oversight of the program.
- #7: The CIA impeded effective White House oversight and decision-making.
- #8: The CIA's operation and management of the program complicated, and in some cases impeded, the national security missions of other Executive Branch agencies.
- #9: The CIA impeded oversight by the CIA's Office of Inspector General.
- #10: The CIA coordinated the release of classified information to the media, including inaccurate information concerning the effectiveness of the CIA's enhanced interrogation techniques.

- #11: The CIA was unprepared as it began operating its Detention and Interrogation Program more than six months after being granted detention authorities.
- #12: The CIA's management and operation of its Detention and Interrogation Program was deeply flawed throughout the program's duration, particularly so in 2002 and early 2003.
- #13: Two contract psychologists devised the CIA's enhanced interrogation techniques and played a central role in the operation, assessments, and management of the CIA's Detention and Interrogation Program. By 2005, the CIA had overwhelmingly outsourced operations related to the program.
- #14: CIA detainees were subjected to coercive interrogation techniques that had not been approved by the Department of Justice or had not been authorized by CIA Headquarters.
- #15: The CIA did not conduct a comprehensive or accurate accounting of the number of individuals it detained, and held individuals who did not meet the legal standard for detention. The CIA's claims about the number of detainees held and subjected to its enhanced interrogation techniques were inaccurate.
- #16: The CIA failed to adequately evaluate the effectiveness of its enhanced interrogation techniques.
- #17: The CIA rarely reprimanded or held personnel accountable for serious and significant violations, inappropriate activities, and systemic and individual management failures.



- #18: The CIA marginalized and ignored numerous internal critiques, criticisms, and objections concerning the operation and management of the CIA's Detention and Interrogation Program.
- #19: The CIA's Detention and Interrogation Program was inherently unsustainable and had effectively ended by 2006 due to unauthorized press disclosures, reduced cooperation from other nations, and legal and oversight concerns.
- #20: The CIA's Detention and Interrogation Program damaged the United States' standing in the world, and resulted in other significant monetary and non-monetary costs.



LESSON SIX

Legacy

Introduction

"America is big enough to admit when it's wrong and confident enough to learn from its mistakes."⁵

- Senator Dianne Feinstein

"It's not about them, it's about us."

- Senator John McCain

"The United States must never adopt the tactics of the enemy. Means are as important as ends."⁶

 Final Report of the United States Select Committee to Study Governmental Operations With Respect to Intelligence Activities, better known as the Church Committee, 1976

Lesson Goals

Students will:

- Explore the idea of legacy in regards to the Senate's "Torture Report"
- Review U.S. and International Laws and Conventions that ban torture
- Discuss possible solutions for repairing America's human rights record abroad

Materials

- Equipment to screen film segments from The Report. To access, click directly on the links within this lesson. For Amazon Prime members, click "View All" next to X-Ray in the upper left corner of your streaming screen and choose "Bonus Content," look for the heading, "The Report Curriculums."
- Copies of The Geneva Conventions Handout

Length

One, 55-minute class period

Activity

Reflecting on the Legacy of the Senate's "Torture Report" and the CIA's Detention and Interrogation Program

- 1. Have students reflect in writing using these prompts:
 - What is a legacy?
 - What are the legacies of the CIA's Detention and Interrogation Program today?
 - What is the legacy of the Senate's "Torture Report?"
 - What is the human cost of torture, to both victims and perpetrators?
- 2. Invite students to share responses from their written reflections.
- 3. Move to watcging two clips from *The Report* to illustrate this idea of legacy. The first is brief and takes place over coffee between Daniel J. Jones (Adam Driver) and one of the Senate intelligence staff members. The second is the final scene from *The Report*.
- "Lasting Effects" (runtime: 48 seconds)
- "Accountability Matters" (runtime 5:10 minutes)
- 4. Debrief the two clips as a class. Ask students for their reactions to the personal toll this report was having on staff members, and to the final information stating that no "CIA personnel has been charged in connection with their actions outlined in the report. Many were promoted, and one [Gina Haspel] is now the CIA director."
- 5. Transition and organize students in pairs. Explain that they will be exploring a collection of documents, video, reports, testimonials focusing on the legacies of the Senate Intelligence Committee Report on Torture. As a pair, they are to read and discuss each of the source materials and reflect on how the information deepens their understanding of the CIA's, its financial and personal costs, and its ongoing legacy.

⁵ Speech on Release of Intelligence Committee's Detention and Interrogation Study, December 2014.

Gouve de la Jane Mayer, The Dark Side, (Anchor Books: New York, 2009), p. 28.



Recommended Legacy Source Materials to Explore

Educator Note: Unfortunately, great source materials and their links do not always stay alive on the web. Before assigning these materials make sure they are still viable. If they have been taken down, please add different source materials. A great to mine for links is the 120 sources within the annotated script on Tab IV, Closer Look on *The Report Movie Deep Dive Website*.

- 1. Geneva Conventions (see handout)
- 2. McCain-Feinstein Anti-Tourture Amendment.7
- John McCain's Speaks out Against Torture,⁸
 December 9, 2014.
- 4. "Memories of a Secret CIA prison", NY Times video.9
- 5. "How U.S. Torture Left a Legacy of Damaged

- Minds,"10 NY Times, October 8, 2016.
- 6. "The CIA closed its original 'black site' years ago.

 But its legacy of torture lives on in Thailand,"
 Los
 Angeles Times, April 22, 2018.
- NPR audio <u>"A Legacy of Torture is Preventing Trials</u> at Guantánamo", November 14, 2019.

Closing

Given the far-reaching legacy of the CIA's Detention and Interrogation Program, and the depth of repair that is necessary regarding America's reputation abroad, facilitate a conversation with class about what this kind of repair could look like.

⁷ McCain-Feinstein Anti-Tourture Amendment was part of the National Defense Authorization Act for Fiscal Year 2016, HR 1735 114th Congress (2015-2016), Section 1045

⁸ https://www.c-span.org/video/?c4518950/user-clip-john-mccain-speaks-torture

⁹ https://www.nytimes.com/video/world/middleeast/100000004694493/memories-of-a-secret-cia-prison.html?action=click>ype=vhs&version=vhs-heading&module=vhs®ion=title-area&cview=true&t=16

¹⁰ https://www.nytimes.com/2016/10/09/world/cia-torture-guantanamo-bay.html

 $^{11 \}quad \underline{https://www.latimes.com/world/asia/la-fg-thailand-cia-haspel-2018-htmlstory.html}$



Geneva Conventions Handout

Section I. Geneva Conventions Relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War¹² (Third Geneva Convention)

Section II. Geneva Conventions Relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War¹³ (Fourth Geneva Convention)

- Common Article 3 of the Geneva Conventions the provision barring torture, cruel and humiliating treatment or "outrages upon personal dignity."
- Whether fighters could qualify for these protections depended on whether they adhered to some basic rules of law such as wearing uniforms, carrying arms openly, answering to a chain of command, and not committing war crimes.
- "Many of those who would one day end up in Guantanamo Bay and other sites were from non-state terrorist groups and did not adhere to these rules. So these fighters were not guaranteed the same protections afforded POWs."¹⁴

Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, (the Convention against Torture) entered into force 26 June 1987.¹⁵

President Ronald Reagan signed the Convention in 1988 and Congress enacted the Torture Statute in 1994 to comply with the Convention. Reagan said at the time the treaty was ratified that the US "will demonstrate unequivocally our desire to bring an end to the abhorrent practice of torture." The Torture Statute provides criminal penalties for torture, conspiracy to commit torture, and attempts to commit torture occurring outside the territorial jurisdiction of the United States, regardless of the citizenship of the perpetrator or victim.

The Torture Statute defines torture as "an act committed by a person acting under the color of law specifically intended to inflict severe physical or mental pain or suffering ... upon another person within his custody or physical control." To prosecute the crime of conspiracy to torture, prosecutors would have to prove the elements of conspiracy, as well as conspiracy to commit the offense of torture under the Torture Statute.¹⁶

¹³ https://ihl-databases.icrc.org/applic/ihl/ihl.nsf/INTRO/380

¹⁵ https://www.ohchr.org/EN/ProfessionalInterest/Pages/CAT.aspx

¹⁶ https://www.hrw.org/report/2015/12/01/no-more-excuses/roadmap-justice-cia-torture#_ftn137



Assessment: Defend Your Point of View

Directions: There are many lessons to be learned from this chapter in American history stretching from the moral and ethical to politics and the rule of law. To demonstrate their understanding of the complexity of the U.S government's response to 9/11, students will choose one quote from the selections offered and write an argumentative essay defending or refuting the point of view expressed in the quote.

"We visit violence on our enemies, but we should not mistreat them, even though they have done unspeakable things to our soldiers and to civilians. That does not justify us doing it to them. You will pay a price for what you do, and it will be vastly greater than whatever it is you got out of taking this action."

- General David Patraeus, Director of the Central Intelligence Agency, September 6, 2011-November 9, 2012

"Enhanced interrogation never secured any crucial information in the War on Terror and more often than not would produce false answers or cause prisoners to totally shut down. Because the prisoners 'looked a little different, spoke a different language, it made it easier' for CIA agents to torture them."

17

- Daniel J. Jones

"I believe past interrogation policies compromised our values, stained our national honor, and did little practical good. . . . I know that such practices don't work. I also know from personal experience that the abuse of prisoners does not produce good, reliable intelligence. Victims of torture will offer intentionally misleading information if they think their captors will believe it.

Our enemies act without conscience. We must not. Now, let us reassert the contrary proposition: that is it essential to our success in this war that we ask those who fight it for us to remember at all times that they are defending a sacred ideal of how nations should be governed and conduct their relations with others—even our enemies."

- John McCain



The educational content for *The Report* was developed by <u>Blueshift Education</u>. We are grateful for the contributions of Daniel J. Jones and Deanna Woodman from The Penn Quarter Group, Human Rights Watch, advisors, and Ashley Hasz from Amazon Studios.

¹⁷ https://www.theatlantic.com/entertainment/archive/2019/01/scott-z-burns-and-daniel-jones-discuss-the-report-movie-cia-sundance/581518/